

The Right to Health in Latin America
HRTS special topics and ANTH variable topics (HRTS-3298/ANTH-3098)
(Version January 27, subject to modifications)

César Abadía-Barrero, DMD. DMSc.

Assistant Professor, Department of Anthropology and Human Rights Institute
Spring 2015. Monday 1:00 – 3:45 pm. FSB 220

Office hours. Mondays 10-12 Beach Hall 436.

E-mail: cesar.abadia@uconn.edu

COURSE PRESENTATION

In an e-mail, Nila Heredia, the general coordinator of ALAMES (Latin America's Social Medicine Association) writes about an article that the association published in October in the 2014 Lancet Series on Universal Health Coverage in Latin America.

“ALAMES has an article that we wrote with the immensurable support from Asa Cristina, whom I want to thank particularly, from Oscar, Rafael, José and Mauricio. That issue has 3 main articles and 8 commentaries. Ours is the only one coming from the civil society and it is, obviously, in disagreement with the WHO and PAHO proposal. It was very hard to publish it given the pressures of the people responsible for the journal and its financial contributors (PAHO, Rockefeller, CEPAL). You can download the entire issue from the PAHO's webpage. However, I am attaching ALAMES's article so that you can circulate, analyze, use and socialized it, keeping in mind the resolution of PAHO's last assembly. The adopted resolution at PAHO's annual assembly about universal health coverage finally included “Universal Access to Health.” I was told that it was the product of a big discussion and fight that the representation of some of the countries that belong to UNASUR gave. I think it is an accomplishment, which, nonetheless, we have to be careful because “Access” will also be distorted. Hugs and thanks. Nila Heredia. General Coordinator”.

This course will introduce students to human rights frameworks and health as a human right discussions in the Latin American context. We will explore the ways in which historical, political, social and public health dimensions promote or harm people's wellbeing. This highly politicized view of the relationship between wellbeing and the social structure of Latin American societies has historical roots in a social movement that has strong ties with academic and leftist sectors and is known as Latin American Social Medicine (LASM). At the core of the possibilities of granting the right to health care are the regional economic and political conditions, in which the role of the United States, as imperial force, will be highlighted and understood.

The course methodology follows a seminar style, which requires extensive reading and active class participation from students. Each student will write a 15-page final paper, lead weekly presentations and discussions, give feedback to classmates and formulate weekly questions and reflections that help advance the class discussion.

The course is divided in four sections. In the first section of the course, *Health and Population Control*, we will review how the development of the Latin American region during the twentieth century was characterized by a period of modern state making and rapid industrialization and how public health and international health campaigns, largely funded and organized by the Rockefeller Foundation, played significant roles as mechanisms of population control that allowed for the expropriation of natural resources while, at the same time, kept “tropical diseases” under control. In the second section *Health and Human Rights in Latin America. Disputed Concepts in a Neocolonial Continent*, we will discuss how some Latin American scholars have defined health as a human right. In the third section, *From Social Welfare States to Neoliberalism*, we will review examples of how the social welfare systems of the region were dismantled as a result of the imposition of neoliberal policies. In the final section, *Latin America Social Movement in Action*, we will analyze several case studies that show policies and programs that have been proposed and carried out by Latin American Social Medicine scholars acting as public officers, or by governments with close links to this movement.

Methodology

This seminar requires active participation. Students will be assigned weekly presentations. The number of presentations will depend upon course enrollment. Each session will be divided into two parts and each part will be in charge of one student. The students in charge of the presentation will make a general summary of the material and indicate the most important aspects for discussion.

Remaining students will prepare an analytical summary of the readings (1 page, double space and font 12 for each part of the discussion) in which they present the connections that the author(s) made between main findings/descriptions/issues around the topic for discussion for that particular week. The analytical summary will end with two questions/comments that can generate discussion for the whole class. Please submit your analytical summary to the instructor up to 10 pm the night before class. The questions will be e-mailed to the instructor and the student in charge of the presentation up to 10 pm the night before the seminar. The student leading the session will organize and bring to class the main aspects to be discussed in the second part. Each part will start with the leading student doing the formal presentation of the material followed by the discussion of the topic and the readings based on the presentation and on the student’s questions and comments.

Guideline for Students Presentations.

You can bring a power point presentation or print a general outline of your presentation to distribute in class. The total presentation should not be longer than 15 minutes.

- 1) Start with brief biographical note of the author(s).
- 2) Organize the outline of your presentation.
 - a. Present a brief summary of the article.
 - b. Stress the main arguments/debates/pieces of data or analyses. Present them in an organized manner.
 - c. End with your own connections/questions/reflections about the readings that can generate discussion.
 - d. Bring the questions of the other students to the table to start the discussion.

Important to keep in mind: When doing an oral presentation, people need "oral punctuation marks", (i.e., pauses, emphasis, a certain structure) that help the audience follow and digest what you are presenting. A very useful complement to presenting the material in a structured way is to use examples and develop the concepts with them. The examples help the audience anchor the concepts, think with them and get a better understanding of the importance of the text. Yes, we all read the papers but we all read them differently and found different aspects to be more relevant, debatable, or challenging. So the use of examples will help the audience see how you understood the material. Even if it is an example from the same text it is really helpful to illustrate for the audience a specific point you or the author are trying to make. Many times we assume that when people are listening to us, they are thinking exactly in the same example or page or idea we are thinking about, but this is not the case. So, an example helps everybody be on the same page and it helps the presenter to make sure the point is the same for all. Finally, make sure that you differentiate your arguments from the author's arguments.

Guideline for in-class discussion

Discussions are of utmost importance for learning during seminars. They prepare us for critical reading and critical thinking. Discussions help us not only to organize our thinking process to explain our points or raise important questions in effective and succinct ways, but they also constitute the basis for collective learning. Through discussions we learn from the authors and the texts and from the different takes, experiences and interpretations of the other students and the instructor. In-class discussion dynamics, however, require some collective agreements:

- 1) Be respectful of other people's ideas and interpretations. One of the arts of discussions is to listen attentively to the other person's point of view. We all can agree or disagree on certain topics but a productive discussion does not intend to convince the other of your point of view but rather to support your argument through the use of concepts, authors, or examples. The best seminars sessions are those in which there are more questions than answers on the table and we keep on thinking about them.
- 2) Be mindful of your use of time. Try to present your point as succinctly as possible so other students have the chance to participate. Keep your presentations to the maximum allowed time of 15 minutes. If you feel you have participated more than others try to give the others a chance to raise their opinions. If you feel you have not participated as much, you are denying others the opportunity to learn from you. Being attentive to your participation helps you become a better listener and to appreciate more other people's ideas.

Grading:

- 1) Class presentations: 30%
- 2) Class participation and analytical summaries: 30%.
- 3) Final paper (15 to 20 double-space pages): 35% (25% final paper + 10% assignments leading to the final paper). The students will work on a paper throughout the seminar. They can choose a theme or topic based on the course material and developed a "review" paper or choose a topic of their

own interest and develop a "research" paper with support of the course material. In either case, additional bibliography and an argument are expected. Students who have their own data are welcome to use it for the papers. We will meet with Marisol Ramos (librarian for anthropology and Latin American studies) to guide us through the use of the library resources. Several

assignments that lead to a successful paper are included.

4) Feedback to classmate's paper. Due on week 10: 5%

All written material will be evaluated based on 1) adequate understanding and use of class material and other relevant literature, 2) clarity and strength of the student's argument, and 3) quality of writing and paper's coherence and organization (grammar, proper punctuation, logical flow of the paper from introduction to conclusions, etc.) I encourage students to set up an appointment with the writing center and use this resource.

Grading Scale:

93+	A
90-92	A-
87-89	B+
83-86	B
80-82	B-
77-79	C+
73-76	C
70-72	C-
67-69	D+
63-66	D
60-62	D-
<60	F

University Policies and Course Policies

Code of Conduct:

Student's participation in this seminar and all their written products should conform to UCONN's student code of conduct. (<http://community.uconn.edu/wp-content/uploads/sites/523/2014/06/1415-The-Student-Code.pdf>). Please review, in particular, the appendix that talks about academic integrity.

In-text proper citation is mandatory and it should follow any of the author-date annotation systems. Complete bibliography should always be included at the end of the documents. The library has citation guides and offers a web-based software (RefWorks) that helps you with the adequate formatting of the bibliography (<http://classguides.lib.uconn.edu/citation>). Papers will be screened for plagiarism.

Please remember that UCONN has strict policies *Against Discrimination, Harassment and Inappropriate Romantic Relationships*. (More information is available at <http://policy.uconn.edu/?p=2884>.) Faculty are also required to report sexual assaults that we witness or are told to the Office of Diversity & Equity. (More information is available at <http://sexualviolence.uconn.edu/>.)

Accommodations for students with disabilities are possible. Please contact the Center for Students with Disabilities (<http://www.csd.uconn.edu/>) and let me know as soon as possible.

Any absences for medical, religious or family matters have to be notified in writing and, if adequate, with supporting documentation.

Please be punctual and abstain from using electronic equipment for matters non-related to the seminar.

If there are any concerns during the seminar please let me know.

Course Materials are on reserve or uploaded on the course's HuskyCT. (Please check both the course material and library resources content areas to find all the materials.)

COURSE SCHEDULE

Week 1 (Jan 26). Course Introduction

Students introductions

In-class exercises.

General overview of the course and of the region.

Assignment of weekly presentations

Notes:

- 1) Please watch the following video before class

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=NKwJI9axblQ>

Bring questions and ideas you have after watching Chomsky's discussion on the "History of US Rule in Latin America."

- 2) Start thinking about a topic for your research paper on "The Right to Health in Latin America."

A useful guide is University of Virginia Library: Thinking Tool: Choosing a Topic and Search Terms

http://www.loex.org/quarterly_extras/392_WolnickBurks_Image1_ThinkingTool.pdf

FIRST SECTION. HEALTH AND POPULATION CONTROL

Week 2 (Feb 2). Health and State Medicine in a post-colonial continent.

First Part

Cueto and Palmer (2014). *Medicine and Public Health in Latin America: A History*. chapter 2, pp. 58-105

Second Part

Coutinho, Marilia (2003). *Tropical Medicine in Brazil. The Case of Chagas' Disease*. In Armus, D (Ed). *Disease in the History of Modern Latin America. From Malaria to AIDS*. pp. 76-100

Zulawski, Ann (2003). *Mental Illness and Democracy in Bolivia. The Manicomio Pacheco, 1935-1950*. In Armus, D (Ed). *Disease in the History of Modern Latin America. From Malaria to AIDS*. pp. 237-267.

Obregón, Diana (2003). *The State, Physicians, and Leprosy in Modern Colombia*. In Armus, D (Ed). *Disease in the History of Modern Latin America. From Malaria to AIDS*. pp. 130-157

Next week assignment due at the beginning of the seminar: PAPER ABSTRACTS OF IDEA (MAX 200 WORDS). Bring a hard copy and submit one electronically.

Week 3 (Feb 9). Developing State Medicine within Internationalism

Birn A and Fee E (2013). *The art of medicine. The Rockefeller Foundation and the international health agenda*. *The Lancet*. 381: 1618-1619.

Brown, E. R. (1976) *Public health in imperialism: early Rockefeller programs at home and abroad*. *American Journal of Public Health* 66 (9), pp. 897-903

Palmer, Steven (1988) Central American Encounters with Rockefeller Public Health, 1914-1921. In Joseph, G Legrand, C and Salvatore R. Close Encounters of Empire. Writing the cultural history of U.S-Latin American Relations. Duke University Press. pp. 311-332
Birn, Anne-Emmanuel (2003). The Rockefeller Foundation's Hookworm Campaign in 1920s Mexico. In Armus, D (Ed). Disease in the History of Modern Latin America. From Malaria to AIDS. pp. 158-182

Next week assignment due at the beginning of the seminar: BRING UPDATED ABSTRACT, KEY WORDS AND GUIDELINE FROM UNIVERSITY OF VIRGINIA FOR OUR IN CLASS EXERCISE WITH MARISOL RAMOS. Bring a hard copy and submit one electronically.

Week 4 (Feb 16). The Pan American Health Organization

This session meets at the library. HBL Classroom 1 (EC-1).

First Part.

Databases and literature search. We will be joined by Marisol Ramos, M.A., M.L.I.S. Librarian for Latin American & Caribbean Studies, Latino Studies, Spanish, and Anthropology, & Curator of Latina/o, Latin American and Caribbean Collections. Marisol is a key resource for all library related matters [Marisol.Ramos@lib.uconn.edu]. She has set up an anthropology research guide <http://classguides.lib.uconn.edu/anthropology>

Second Part.

Cueto, M (2007). The Value of Health. A history of the Pan American Health Care Organization. Washington, D.C. Pan American Health Organization, pp. 39-119.

SECOND SECTION. HEALTH AND HUMAN RIGHTS IN LATIN AMERICA. DISPUTED CONCEPTS IN A NEOCOLONIAL CONTINENT.

Week 5 (Feb 23). Health within Economic, Political and Military Violence in the mid-twentieth century.

First Part.

Cárdenas, Sonia (2010). Human Rights in Latin America. A Politics of Terror and Hope. Part 1, pp. 21-79.

Second Part.

Smith-Nonini, Sandy (2010). Healing the Body Politic. El Salvador's Popular Struggle for Health Rights from Civil War to Neoliberal Peace. Prologue (xi-xix) and Part I (1-71).

Next week assignment due at the beginning of the seminar: SUBMIT NEW ABSTRACT WITH LITERATURE SEARCH LIST AND TWO ANOTATED BIBLIOGRAPHY (one page each). Bring a hard copy and submit one electronically.

Week 6 (March 2). Pioneers of Latin American Social Medicine 1

Background reading for both parts:

Birn, Anne-Emanuelle and Nervi, Laura (2014). Political roots of the struggle for health justice in Latin America. The Lancet. October 16, 2014. Doi. [http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736\(14\)61844-4](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736(14)61844-4)

First Part.

Salvador Allende Reader: Chile's Voice of Democracy. (Selections)

Allende, S (2005). Medical and Social Reality in Chile. *Int J Epidemiol*, 34(3), 732-736

Waitzkin, H (2005). Commentary: Salvador Allende and the birth of Latin America Social Medicine. *Int J Epidemiol* 34: 739-741.

Tedeshi S, Brown T and Fee E (2003). Considerations on Human Capital. *American Journal of Public Health* 93(12): 2012-2015

Second Part.

Guevara, Che (1952). Motorcycle Diaries on Chile. Selections (pp. 20-29). *Querida mama* p. 20 and *Por el camino de los siete lagos*, P. 21 on until end of Chile, p. 29.

Guevara, Che (1960). On Revolutionary Medicine. Speech.

<http://www.marxists.org/archive/guevara/1960/08/19.htm>

Guevara, Che (1961). Economics Cannot be Separated from Politics.

<http://www.marxists.org/archive/guevara/1961/08/08.htm>. Could be move to Cuba...? Or right before Alliance for Progress...

Guevara, Che (1964). At the United Nations. Speech

<http://www.marxists.org/archive/guevara/1964/12/11.htm>.. Could be moved to Cuba..?

Guevara, Che (1965). Man and Socialism in Cuba

<http://www.marxists.org/archive/guevara/1965/03/man-socialism.htm>

Writings on Politics and Revolution, pp. 113-142 and 275-293.

Week 7 (March 9). The Latin American Social Medicine Movement

First Part.

Granda, E (2008). ALAMES turns 24. *Social Medicine*, 3(2), 165-172

Tajer, D. (2003). "Latin American Social Medicine: Roots, Development During the 1990s, and Current Challenges." *American Journal of Public Health* 93(12): 2023-2027.

Waitzkin, H., C. Iriart, et al. (2001). "Social Medicine Then and Now: Lessons From Latin America." *American Journal of Public Health* 91(10): 1592-1601.

Secon Part.

Breilh, J. (2008). Latin American critical ('Social') epidemiology: new settings for an old dream. *Int J of Epidemiology*. Aug;37(4):745-50.

Breilh, Spiegel and Yassi. Conceptualizing the Social Determination of Health: Insights from Collaborative Research in Latin America. Working Paper 2014.

Abadía-Barrero, C. and Martínez, A (Submitted). Care and Consumption: A Latin American Social Medicine's Conceptual Framework to Assess Oral Health Inequalities

Optional

Galeano, D. Trotta, L. Spinelli, H. (2011). Juan César García and the Latin American social medicine movement notes on a life trajectory. *Salud Colectiva*, 7(3): 285-315. (Spanish)

THIRD SECTION. FROM SOCIAL WELFARE STATES TO NEOLIBERALISM

Week 8 (March 23). LA health care reform.

First Part.

Caporaso, James (1980). Dependency Theory: Continuities and Discontinuities in Development Studies. *International Organization* 34(4): 605-628

Sanchez, Omar (2003). The Rise and Fall of the Dependency Movement: Does It Inform Underdevelopment Today? *E.I.A.L* 14(2): 31-50

Second Part.

Armada, F. and C. Muntaner (2004). The Visible Fist of the Market: Health Reforms in Latin America. Unhealthy Health Policy. A Critical Anthropological Examination. A. Castro and M. Singer. Walnut Creek, Altamira Press: 29-42.

Homedes, N. and A. Ugalde (2005). "Why neoliberal health reforms have failed in Latin America." *Health Policy* 71: 83-96

Heredia, N. et.al. (2014). The right to health: what model for Latin America? *The Lancet*. Published online October 16, 2014.

Next week assignment due at the beginning of the seminar: SUBMIT FIRST DRAFT PAPERS that include paper outline/sections and subsections and 5 to 7 pages. Bring two hard copies and submit one electronically.

Week 9 (March 30). Healing the Body Politic

First Part.

Martín-Baro I. Writings for a Liberation Theology, pp. 103-135.

Second Part.

Smith-Nonini, Sandy (2010). Healing the Body Politic. El Salvador's Popular Struggle for Health Rights from Civil War to Neoliberal Peace. Part 4 (195-256).

Next week assignment due at the beginning of the seminar: Bring constructive comments to your classmate's paper (1 to 2 pages, double-spaced, 12 point font.) Comments should include: 1) A general summary of the paper on your own words. 2) Things that you like and/or think are working well for the paper. 3) Feedback on things that you think are not working well or could be improve. Be specific with your suggestions. Bring two hard copies and submit one electronically.

FOURTH SECTION. LATIN AMERICAN SOCIAL MOVEMENT IN ACTION.

Week 10 (April 6). Judicialization of the right to health care in Latin America

First Part.

Claudia Marcela Vargas-Peláez, Marina Raijche Mattozo Rover, Silvana Nair Leite, Francisco Rossi Buenaventura, Mareni Rocha Farias (2014). Right to health, essential medicines, and lawsuits for access to medicines – A scoping study. Review Article. *Social Science & Medicine* pp. 48-55

Ole Frithjof Norheim and Bruce M. Wilson (2014). Health Rights Litigation and Access to Medicines: Priority Classification of Successful Cases from Costa Rica's Constitutional Chamber of the Supreme Court. *Health and Human Rights* 16/2

Second Part.

Abadía-Barrero C. (In Press). Neoliberal Justice and the Transformation of the Moral: The Privatization of the Right to Health Care in Colombia. *Medical Anthropology Quarterly*

O'Connell, C (2014). Litigating Reproductive Health Rights in the Inter-American System: What Does a Winning Case Look Like? *Health and Human Rights Journal*. 16(2): 116-128

Week 11 (April 13). This session will meet at the Dodd Center - room 162 at 12:30.

First Part 12:30-2:00. HRI (Human Rights Institute) Lunchtime Seminar.

I will give a presentation titled "For Profit Management of the Right to Health. Consequences in Colombia"

Second Part 2:15-3:45: **Brazil and AIDS.**

Galvão, J. (2002). "Brazilian Policy for the distribution and production of antiretroviral drugs: a privilege or a right?" *Cadernos de Saúde Pública* 18(1): 213-219.

Ayres, J. R. d. C. M., V. Paiva, et al. (2006). "Vulnerability, Human Rights, and Comprehensive Health Care Needs of Young People Living With HIV/AIDS." *American Journal of Public Health* 96(6): 1001-1006.

Abadía Barrero, C. E. (2011). I have AIDS but I am Happy. *Children's Subjectivities, AIDS, and Social Responses in Brazil*. Bogotá, Universidad Nacional de Colombia. Chapter 6. pp. 175-201. Chapter 7. pp. 203-223.

Week 12 (April 20). Community Health Programs

First Part.

Han, Clara (2012) *Life in Debt: Times of Care and Violence in Neoliberal Chile*. Introduction (pp. 1-28), Chapters 5 (pp. 167-201) and 6 (pp. 202-230).

Second Part.

Brotherton, Sean (2012). *Revolutionary Medicine: Health and the Body in Post-Soviet Cuba* (Part 2) pp. 57-144

Week 13 (April 27). Cuba and internationalisms.

First Part.

Brotherton, Sean (2012). *Revolutionary Medicine: Health and the Body in Post-Soviet Cuba* (Part 3 and Conclusions) pp. 145-189

Second Part.

Briggs, Charles (2011). "All Cubans are doctors!" news coverage of health and bioexceptionalism in Cuba. *Social Science & Medicine*, Volume 73 (7): 1037-1044

Pending one reference

Cuba's extraordinary global medical record shames the US blockade

<http://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2014/dec/03/cuba-global-medical-record-shames-us-blockade-ebola?CMP=EMCNEWEML6619I2>

Cuba leads fight against Ebola in Africa as west frets about border security

<http://www.theguardian.com/world/2014/oct/12/cuba-leads-fights-against-ebola-africa>

A Cuban Brain Drain, Courtesy of the US

http://www.nytimes.com/2014/11/17/opinion/a-cuban-brain-drain-courtesy-of-us.html?_r=1

Final Papers due May 4